

**Governor's Task Force on Energy Efficiency and Renewables
Renewables Workgroup
Rvsd. March 9, 2004**

Renewable Energy Standards and Targets Comparison

Standards and Proposals Included

- Existing RPS statute s.196.378
- RENEW's proposal dated February 3, 2004
- Xcel's proposal dated February 18, 2004
- UW-Madison (DOA/PSC) study (subcontractor report by the Union of Concerned Scientists from October 31, 2003)¹

| | EXISTING RPS | RENEW's PROPOSAL | XCEL'S PROPOSAL | UW-Madison (DOA/PSC) STUDY |
|--|--|----------------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|
| 1. Estimated Annual Growth Rate | 93,000 MWh per year to 2011 | 350-375,000 MWh per year to 2015 | 485,000 MWh per year to 2015 | 700,000 MWh per year to 2013 |
| 2. Status of Hydro | Capped at 0.6% | All hydro included | All hydro included | Capped at 0.6% |
| 3. 2005 Target | 1.2% | Existing share | Varies by utility | 2% |
| 4. 2010 Target | 1.9 % | Existing share + 2.5% | Varies by utility | 7% |
| 5. 2015 Target | 2.2% | Existing share + 5% | 10% (for each utility) | 10% |
| 6. Applies to all utilities? | Exempts those utilities that reach 10% | Yes | Exempts those utilities that reach 10% | Yes |
| 7. How implement? | State law | Through PSC order | Voluntary | Not addressed |
| 8. Green pricing allowed? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |

¹ 10% by 2013, capping hydro at 0.6% scenario. ² 5% statewide average. ³ 7.5% statewide average. ⁴ 10% statewide average.

**Governor's Task Force on Energy Efficiency and Renewables
Renewables Workgroup
Rvsd. March 9, 2004**

| | EXISTING RPS | RENEW's PROPOSAL | XCEL'S PROPOSAL | UW-Madison (DOA/PSC) STUDY |
|--|---|---|---|---|
| 9. Treatment of Credit Trading | Allows for full intrastate and interstate trading | No expansion/extension of current program | Expands to include existing hydro | Extends current trading program to 2013 |
| 10. Legislation required? | No | No | Yes | Not addressed |
| 11. Provisions for Implementation Delays? | None | Yes: - Consideration for low annual growth rates - Extension/non-extension of the federal production tax credit - Delay due to local siting issues | Yes: - higher than expected incremental marginal cost for RE - Utility has taken all reasonable means - adverse impact to a utility's rates by >5% over the 10-year implementation period - Delay due to local siting issues - Operational requirements of RTO prevented transfer of RE - Unavailable or too costly ancillary services - Low ave. growth rate <1.5% annually | Not addressed |

**Governor's Task Force on Energy Efficiency and Renewables
Renewables Workgroup
Rvsd. March 9, 2004**

| | EXISTING RPS | RENEW's PROPOSAL | XCEL'S PROPOSAL | UW-Madison (DOA/PSC) STUDY |
|---|---|---|------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 12. Penalties | Court imposed forfeiture of \$5,000-500,000 | PSC imposed penalty | None – voluntary | Not addressed |
| 13. Banking of Credits | Infinite banking allowed | Not addressed | 5 years | Not addressed |
| 14. Reporting Requirement | Individual utilities report annually to the DOA/PSC | PSC generic docket to track compliance & integrate w/PSC planning process | None - voluntary | Not addressed |
| 15. Treatment of Out-of-State Facilities | | | | |